

Towards global indicator of durability performance and carbon footprint of clinker-slag-limestone cement-based concrete exposed to carbonation

Imane Elkhaldi, Emmanuel Rozière, Philippe Turcry, Ahmed Loukili

► To cite this version:

Imane Elkhaldi, Emmanuel Rozière, Philippe Turcry, Ahmed Loukili. Towards global indicator of durability performance and carbon footprint of clinker-slag-limestone cement-based concrete exposed to carbonation. Journal of Cleaner Production, 2022, 380, pp.134876. 10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.134876 . hal-04115746

HAL Id: hal-04115746 https://hal.science/hal-04115746v1

Submitted on 27 Jan 2025

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Towards global indicator of durability performance and carbon footprint of clinker-slag-limestone cement-based concrete exposed to carbonation

4 Imane ELKHALDI^{1.2}, Emmanuel ROZIERE^{1*}, Philippe Turcry³, Ahmed LOUKILI¹

¹ Institut de recherche en génie civil et mécanique, UMR CNRS 6183, Ecole Centrale de Nantes, 44321, Nantes cedex 3,
 France

² Edycem, Rue du Fléchet, 85600 Boufféré, France

8 ³ La Rochelle University, LaSIE UMR CNRS 7356, Avenue Michel Crepeau, 17042, La Rochelle Cedex 1, France

9 * Corresponding author, emmanuel.roziere@ec-nantes.fr

10 Abstract

11 This article aims at defining an effective global warming potential criterion for qualifying a 12 concrete mixture based on a CO₂ calculation and durability performance tests, as well as 13 understanding the parameters that influence the duration of initiation and propagation of 14 corrosion in concretes exposed to carbonation-induced corrosion. An experimental study was 15 conducted in order to assess the resistance to carbonation and the electrical resistivity for 16 concretes made of multi-composite cements with ground-granulated blast furnace slag 17 (GGBS) and limestone in the limits of new cement European standard EN 197-5, and to 18 understand the link between these properties and the composition of the cements. A model is 19 presented which allows to predict the service life of the concrete cover from the material data 20 of the concrete (accelerated carbonation rate, electrical resistivity), environmental parameters 21 (HR, T, CO₂) and minimum cover. It was found that the reactive CaO content of cements 22 influences the carbonation rate of concrete, and the electrical resistivity and the GGBS 23 content of cements were found to have a good correlation. The model used allows comparing 24 the studied cements from the CO₂ emission/service life ratios.

- 25 Keywords: Slag; Limestone; Durability; Carbonation; Resistivity; CO₂
- 26
- 27
- 28
- 29

1- Introduction

31 The greenhouse gases emissions (GHGE) of building sector have two main causes: the energy 32 used for heating, cooling, and lighting the buildings and the production of construction 33 materials. Historically, environmental regulations have first focused on energy efficiency of 34 buildings by reducing their energy consumption but the recent regulations, such as French 35 environmental regulation RE2020, also set targets the GHGE associated to materials 36 throughout their whole life cycle. This performance objective is called E+C- (Ministry for the 37 ecological and solidary transition, 2020), as the energy efficiency must be improved and the 38 carbon footprint should be reduced by using construction materials with low environmental 39 impact. Thus, research works are recently moving towards exploring ways to reduce carbon 40 emissions of concrete, which is the most widely used construction material. Cement is 41 responsible for more than 75% of the carbon emissions of concrete from its manufacturing 42 phase to its placement (Di Filippo et al., 2019). This is mainly due to clinker production 43 which is both energy-intensive and polluting. The CO₂ emissions related to the production of 44 cement represent 4 to 5% of all greenhouse gases produced worldwide in 2019 (IPCC, 2022).

45 Nonetheless, normatively speaking, there is no regulatory definition of "low-carbon 46 concrete". In the literature, several indicators have been defined, such as the carbon cost of 1 47 MPa compressive strength in (Bolte et al., 2019). This has also been designated by CO₂ 48 efficiency to characterize low carbon concrete (Yang et al., 2017). This concept is interesting 49 as it takes into account the performance of the concrete that represents its functional unit from 50 a life cycle analysis (LCA) point of view. However, it does not take into account the 51 durability aspect of concrete, which is equally important. The long term performance of 52 concrete is actually an important factor to consider since maintenance work on reinforced 53 concrete structures induces a significant carbon cost which is added to the primary carbon 54 cost of the structure (Gartner, 2004).

55 Compressive strength is not a fully satisfactory durability indicator, as it cannot provide a 56 reliable estimation of the service life (SL) duration of reinforced concrete structures, which 57 depends on several factors, especially environmental actions. In the current concrete standard 58 in Europe (EN 206-1), the environmental conditions are represented by the exposure class. 59 For the general case of buildings, which are neither close to the sea nor exposed to chemical 60 attacks, the most considered exposure class is XC class (XC1 to XC4) which concerns 61 concretes subjected to the risk of corrosion induced by carbonation The environnemental 62 conditions concerned by this exposure class are described in table 1.

	Description of the environment
XC1	Permanently dry or wet
XC2	Wet, rarely dry
XC3	Moderate humidity
XC4	Alternating wet and dry

This standard includes deemed-to-satisfy provisions, i.e. for each class the maximum W/C ratio, the minimum cement content as well as requirements on the contents of mineral additions (MAs) which can be used as a MA as a replacement of Portland cement with a high clinker content (> 80%). To deviate from these prescriptions, it remains possible to use performance-based specifications (Rozière et al., 2009).

70 In parallel with the new environmental regulation, the new cement standard EN 197-5 (2021) 71 has also been published. It describes two categories of ternary cements with lower clinker 72 contents, namely Portland CEM II/C-M cements that incorporates a higher percentage of 73 MAs (up to 50%) than existing CEM II Portland cements, and a new category of cements 74 which is CEM VI with a clinker content ranging from 35 to 49%. This standard aims at 75 facilitating the integration of cements with low clinker content into the market by including 76 them in a regulatory framework. However, as long as "low-carbon concrete" has not been 77 defined, it cannot be said that CEM II/C-M and CEM VI are "low-carbon cements"; it 78 actually depend on the durability of concretes made with these cements.

79 Ternary cements based on a MA rich in reactive silico-aluminates, such as metakaolin and 80 ground granulated blast furnace slag (GGBS) have been the subject of many research works 81 recently (Arumugam, 2022). The particular interest in these binders lies in their great 82 potential to maximize the clinker replacement rate (Proske et al., 2018). The synergy between 83 aluminates and limestone enhances the mechanical properties in the short and long term. The 84 nucleation effect of limestone powder actually accelerates the hydration of the clinker at early 85 age (Palm et al., 2016), and the GGBS, given its latent hydraulicity and its pozzolanic 86 properties, improves the mechanical properties in the long term (Giergiczny, 2019). In addition, the reaction of the calcium carbonates with the aluminates from the clinker and the 87 88 GGBS, stabilizes ettringite and carboaluminates, which densifies the microstructure

(Matschei et al., 2007). The hydration and microstructure of this type of binders has been
largely studied in the literature (Adu-Amankwah, 2016).

91 However, few data can be found on the durability of concrete based on these cements with 92 respect to corrosion induced by carbonation. The carbonation risk of these binders has been 93 studied in (Bolte et al., 2019) and (Proske et al., 2018). In both papers, it was shown that the 94 carbonation resistance of concrete containing composite cements is similar to that of concrete 95 made with CEM III/A GGBS cements with the same mechanical strength but remains low 96 compared to Portland cement. The carbonation rate has been found to be inversely 97 proportional to the clinker content of the cements (Bolte et al., 2019). The resistance to 98 carbonation is an important parameter since it provides information on the initiation phase of 99 corrosion, but remains insufficient to quantify the service life of concrete structures with 100 respect to corrosion induced by carbonation. The corrosion propagation phase is actually significant under certain environmental conditions (Farissi, 2020; Tuutti, 1982). According to 101 102 (Tuutti, 1982), this phase depends on the electrical resistivity of the concrete which provides 103 information on the corrosion rate of the reinforcements (Andrade, 2010). Data on the 104 electrical resistivity (ρ) or the conductivity ($1/\rho$) of cementitious materials containing GGBS 105 have been published (Alonso et al., 2012), but there are very few published data about 106 electrical resistivity of concretes containing clinker-GGBS-limestone (K-S-LL) multi-107 composite cements.

108 This article deals with the ternary cements K-S-LL within the scope of the new cement 109 European standard EN 197-5. The approach of this study aims at evaluating the service life 110 duration, the CO₂ emissions related to the production of concretes made up with K-S-LL 111 cements and binary limestone and GGBS cements respectively. The purpose of the 112 experimental study is to assess the influence of durability parameters on the SL of concrete exposed to carbonation-induced corrosion, namely carbonation resistance and electrical 113 114 resistivity, as well as to understand the link between those properties and cement composition. 115 The results are incorporated into an empirical model to predict the service life of the concretes 116 studied. The ratio of the CO₂ emissions related to the production of concrete to the service life 117 will be used as a new indicator to estimate the interest in using the new cements.

118

119

2- Experimental program and procedures

122

2.1. Materials and mixtures

The ternary cements were manufactured in the laboratory using a V-shaped rotary mixer from four powders: ordinary Portland cement (CEM I), limestone Portland cement (CEM II/B-LL) with a limestone filler (LL) content of 30% by mass, ground granulated blast furnace GGBS (GGBS), and gypsum. CEM I and CEMII/B-LL were commercial cements made with the same clinker (K). The chemical composition and the physical properties of the raw materials are given in table 2. The particle size distribution of the raw materials are given in figure 2.

Table 2: Chemical and physical properties of the raw powders

	CEM I	CEMII/B-LL	GGBS
Chemical Composition	[%]		
CaO	63.6	60.4	41.6
SiO ₂	20.1	15.9	35.9
Al ₂ O ₃	4.4	3.4	11.7
Fe ₂ O ₃	2.2	1.7	0.5
SO ₃	3.3	2.9	0.1
MgO	4	3.1	7.4
TiO ₂	0.2	-	0.7
S	0.02	-	0.7
Na ₂ Oeq	0.6	0.42	0.58
Loss On Ignition (LOI)	1.4	12.5	-
Clinker percentage (%)	100	70	-
Clinker Mineralogical c	omposition	[%]	
C_3S	67	68	-
C_2S	11	10	-
C ₃ A	9	9	-
C ₄ AF	7	7	-
Gypsum	4.9	4.9	-
Physical and mechanica	al propertie	5	
Density	3.14	3.01	2.9
Blaine surface [cm ² /g]	4882	5168	>4200
Time of initial setting	1h55	2h36	-
f _{c2j} (MPa)	44	25	-
$f_{c28j}(MPa)$	63	44	-

¹²⁹

131 The CaCO₃ content of limestone in CEM II/B-LL was 95.5%. Additional gypsum was 132 incorporated in order to reach a Calcium sulfate/(Clinker+GGBS) ratio of at least 3% to have 133 enough calcium sulphate to control the short-term hydration of the aluminates contained in 134 both clinker and GGBS. The gypsum was the same as included in CEM I and CEM II/B-LL.

135 The compositions of studied cements are shown in table 3 and on the K-S-LL ternary diagram 136 of figure 1. This diagram also includes the boundaries of new CEM II/C (green zone) and 137 CEM VI (yellow zone) cements defined in standard EN 197-5 (EN 197-5:2021). The raw 138 materials were proportioned by mass in order to obtain four different binders: 2 ternary 139 binders C1 (CEM VI) and C3 (limit between CEM II/C and CEM VI), and 2 conventional binary cements, CEM II, limestone Portland cement, widely used today, and CEM III, which 140 141 comply with the existing cement standard EN 197-1. CEM II and CEM III are used as 142 references to evaluate the relevance of the new ternary cements. C1 and C3 have the same 143 Limestone/Clinker (LL/K) ratio of 0.4, a preliminary study on 15 ternary cements showed that 144 C1 and C3 cements had the same strength on standardized mortar from 7 days, and both 145 concrete had the same characteristic strength (table 5). C1 and CEM III have the same clinker 146 content with 15% of the slag substituted in limestone for C1. Studying these two cements 147 allows to study the effect of limestone on the durability of concrete based on ternary cements 148 with high clinker replacement.

149

 Table 3: Composition of the studied cements (mass proportions)

Mix designation	Clinker	GGBS	Limestone	LL/K
CEM II	90	0	10	0.11
CEM III	35	65	0	0
C1	35	50	15	0.43
C3	50	30	20	0.40

150

151 The homogeneity of the powders prepared was confirmed using X-ray fluorescence 152 spectrometry (XRF) analysis by determining the atomic composition of the raw and mixed 153 powders. The theoretical composition calculated from the measured composition of the raw 154 powders was compared to the actual measured composition of the mixed ones. The relative 155 errors found were small especially for the preponderant elements, namely Ca and Si 156 (maximum error < 2%)



Figure 1: Studied cements, and boundaries of new ternary cements CEM II/C and CEM VI

160 Four concrete mixtures were designed keeping all the mass ratios constant; only the cement 161 composition varied. The properties of aggregates are given in Table 4. The particle size 162 distribution of the aggregates used is given in figure 2. A polycarboxylate-type plasticizer 163 showing a good compatibility with the binders studied was used. The plasticizer content was 164 adjusted to reach around 150 mm slump of fresh concrete. The compositions of concrete 165 mixtures comply with the requirements of the NF 206/CN standard with regard to the 166 maximum W/C ratios (0.65 and 0.60), the minimum cement content (260 and 280 kg/m³) for 167 XC1-XC2 and XC3-XC4 exposure classes respectively. It is noteworthy that the compressive 168 strengths obtained at 28 days comply with the minium strength classes of 20 and 25 MPa 169 characteristic compressive strength respectively. The maximum aggregate size was 10 mm. 170 The concrete mixtures and proprerties are given in table 5 with f_{ck} the characteristic 171 compressive strength.

172

173

Table 4: Physical properties of the aggregates

Mix designation	Sand 0/4	Sand 0/2	Gravel 6.3/10
Mineralogy	Siliceous rolled sand	Amphibolite crushed sand	Amphibolite crushed gravel
Water absorption (%)	0.40	0.50	0.60
Density (kg/m ³)	2620	2960	2960



175

Figure 2: Particle size distribution of the raw powders and aggregates

176

177

Table 5: Mixture composition (in kg/m³) and properties of the studied concretes

	CEM II	CEM III	C1	C3
Sand 0/4		43	4	
Sand 0/2	424			
Gravel 6,3/10	1051			
Cement		31	3	
Water		18	8	
Plasticizer (%)	0.3	0.3	0.45	0.45
Paste volume (1)	292	290	290	291
W/C		0.6	60	
$f_{ck} (MPa)^{(*)}$	40.2	32.7	25.3	25.4

178 ^(*) fck is the characteristic strength deduced from the average 28d strength according to
 179 Eurocode 2.

180

2.2. Experimental program

The concrete and cement pastes prepared have the same W/C ratio. The concrete specimens were demolded after 24 hours and kept in water for 90 days in a room at 20 °C. Six cylindrical concrete specimens of $\emptyset 110*220 \text{ mm}^3$ were manufactured for the accelerated carbonation test and three cubic specimens of $150*150*150 \text{ mm}^3$ size for the electrical resistivity tests.

Cylindrical cement paste samples of $Ø25*50 \text{ mm}^3$ dimensions were prepared with the same 186 187 W/C and cement composition as the studied concretes. Xanthan gum, which is a 188 polysaccharide-based viscosity modifying admixture, was added to the cement paste to limit 189 bleeding at proportions ranging from 0.6 to 1 wt% to the liquid fraction; as it was found to 190 have limited effect on binders reactivity and cement hydration and therefore can be 191 considered inert (Aboulayt et al., 2018). Xanthan gum was used at a constant W/C ratio. The 192 cement pastes were demolded after 24 hours and kept in water in a room at 20 °C for 90 days 193 to guarantee a degree of maturity comparable to the cement paste contained in the concretes. 194 One paste sample was used to assess the microstructure of sound cement paste and another 195 one was carbonated.

196

2.2.1. Durability tests:

a) Accelerated carbonation test

198 The accelerated carbonation testing procedure was adapted from European standard 199 prCEN/TS 12390-12 to increase its sensitivity to materials performance (Turcry et al., 2019). 200 The samples were obtained by sawing in two Φ 110*220 mm³ specimens; the lower and upper 201 part of the sample were covered by adhesive aluminum to allow lateral carbonation. 202 Subsequently, the specimens underwent the following pre-treatment to promote optimal 203 conditions to accelerate carbonation:

Drying at 45 °C +/- 5 °C with 3 specimens of standardized mortar 40*40*160 mm³ made of
CEM II/A-L prepared 35 days before the start date of drying. Drying lasts a minimum of 14
days until the mass loss of the control mortar specimens reaches at least 5.5%.

- Humidification in a climatic room at 20 °C and 52% RH for 7 days.

The interest of these two steps is to ensure optimal carbonation conditions. The drying step favours the CO_2 diffusion through concrete porous netwok, then humidification results in higher water saturation in the external part of the samples, which restores an aqueous phase in the porosity allowing carbonation reactions to take place. After preconditioning, the samples were placed in a carbonation chamber at 20 °C, 65% RH and 3% CO₂. The carbonation rate was estimated by monitoring the progress of the carbonation front at 0, 28, 42, and 70 days using phenolphthalein, on 3 specimens split in two.

For the cement pastes samples, the sample used for carbonation was cut into thin discs about5 mm thick to be carbonated in the same conditions as concrete specimens. Before putting

them in the carbonation chamber $(20^{\circ}C, 65\% \text{ RH}, 3\% \text{ CO}_2)$, these discs were dried for 2 hours at 40°C and placed in a room at 20°C and 50% RH for 24h to ensure optimal carbonation conditions without altering their phase composition. The carbonation time was 42 days for all cement pastes. At the end of this period, a phenolphthalein test was carried out on a fragment of disc to check the complete carbonation of the disc.

b) Electrical resistivity

The measurements were carried out on three cylindrical Ø75*70 mm³ specimens cored in the 223 224 middle of cubic concrete samples and cut in two. The device consists of two halves insulating 225 cylinders with 5 ring-electrodes equally spaced along the height (du Plooy et al., 2013). 226 Figure 3 shows the arrangement of the electrodes and the measurement points. This 227 configuration allows 4 measurement points on different slices of the sample and accounts for 228 any heterogeneities. Indeed, it has been reported that the configuration with 4 measurement 229 points gives more reliable results than that with two points (Hornbostel et al., 2013). The 230 current is injected through two stainless steel disk electrodes, and the current measurement is 231 made between two ring-electrodes. The measurement cell is connected to a commercial 232 resistivity meter (Syscal Pro, Iris instrument). The current injected is a square alternating 233 current at a frequency of 4Hz. The electrical resistivity is given by equation 1.

$$\rho = G \frac{\Delta V}{I} \tag{1}$$

 ρ : is the electrical resistivity in (Ω .m), ΔV (V) is the measured potential difference, I (A) is the injected current and G is the geometric coefficient which is equal to the section to length A/L ratio (m). A is the cross-sectional area of the specimen and L is the length of the specimen.



Figure 3: Schematic view of the resistivity measurement, adapted from (du Plooy et al., 2013)

The G coefficients for each measurement range are calculated by numerical modelling, thedetails are provided in (du Plooy et al., 2013).

243 2.2.2. Microstructural characterization

244 In order to assess the effect of hydration and carbonation on the pore size distribution (PSD), 245 MIP analyses were performed on non-carbonated and carbonated concrete cubes. The cubes 246 were cut from partially carbonated cylindrical Ø75*70 mm³ specimens with a minimum carbonation depth of 13 mm. The non-carbonated samples were taken from the center and the 247 248 carbonated one from the carbonated external layer.Measurements were carried out on with a 249 Micromeritics AUTOPORE IV 9500 porosimeter at increasing pressures up to 400 MPa 250 which corresponds to a minimum pore radius of 1.5 nm. The uncertainty on the threshold pore 251 diameter was $\pm 5\%$ of the average value.

252 TGA analyses were performed on 50 mg sample of ground carbonated (C) and non 253 carbonated (NC) cement pastes. Hydration was stopped before the test using isopropanol 254 (Cardinaud et al., 2021). The temperature increased from 20 to 1000 °C at a rate of 10 255 °C/min. Water loss between 40 °C and 400 °C refers to bound water (BW40-400°C) and it is 256 attributed to C-S-H, ettringite, AFm and carboaluminates decomposition. It is calculated using 257 stepwise method and reported to anhydrous cement (equation 2). The CO₂ which decomposes 258 from the initial limestone (Lini) present in the cement is added to the remaining mass after 259 900°C heating to obtain the anhydrous cement.:

260
$$m_{anh} = m_{900^{\circ}C} + L_{ini} \frac{M_{CO_2}}{M_{CaCO_3}}$$
(2)

with: $m_{900^{\circ}C}$ the weight at 900°C, L_{ini} the percentage of the initial limestone present in the cement, and M_{CO_2} and M_{CaCO_3} the molar masses of CO₂ and CaCO₃ which are equal to 44 g/mol and 100 g/mol respectively.

264 Water loss between 400°C and 550°C is attributed to portlandite decomposition. It was 265 calculated using tangent method (Kocaba, 2009). The portlandite (CH) content was then 266 calculated using the molar masses of CH and water. For non carbonated cement paste, CH 267 content was corrected with the mass loss between 550 and 850 C corresponding to the CO₂ 268 released by the decomposition of CaCO₃ formed from carbonated portlandite according to 269 (Cardinaud et al., 2021). The total CH content was reported to the mass of anhydrous cement. 270 The sum of the two water losses mentioned above refers to the total bound water (BW40-550°C) 271 which gives information about the hydration degree of the binder. The uncertainty on the CH 272 content was $\pm 4\%$ of the average value, and the uncertainty on the **BW**_{40-550°C} content was $\pm 2\%$ 273 of the average value.

274 XRD analysis was performed on carbonated and non carbonated ground cement pastes using 275 a Malvern Panalytical Aeris instrument. Scanning program consisted in rotating between 7 276 and $70^{\circ}2\theta$ with a step size of $0.01^{\circ}2\theta$ and a 480.165 ms per step.

277

3- Service life prediction model

The service life (SL) of concrete structures is largely determined by the durability of its concrete cover, which protects steel reinforcement from the corrosion induced by environmental actions. Theoretically, the SL of the cover can be quantified based on the environment of the structure, the mechanisms that govern aggressive agent penetration, and the properties of the concrete.

According to the conceptual model of Tuutti (Tuutti, 1982) (figure 4) the SL of reinforced
concrete structure can be divided into two phases: initiation and propagation phase.







Figure 4: Service life phases according to Tuutti's model (Tuutti, 1982)

-The initiation phase characterizes the period when the aggressive agents (CO₂, Cl⁻) penetrate
the concrete cover and reach the reinforcement. This diffusion is accompanied by a change in
the microstructure and the pore solution.

291 - The propagation phase: Corrosion does not occur totally once the carbonation front or 292 chlorides reach the reinforcement. The reinforcement corrodes gradually until it reaches a critical corrosion depth (X_{crit}), which corresponds to a diameter loss and results in a crack 293 294 opening on the concrete surface. For a fracture opening of 0.1 mm, there are empirical formulas that give X_{crit} (Torres-Acosta and Sagues, 2004). The propagation phase can be 295 296 divided into several sub-periods describing different limit states (Markeset and Myrdal, 297 2008). In our study, we consider only the first limit state, i.e. the appearance of the first cracks 298 due to corrosion.

There are models based on a performance-based approach to predict the corrosion initiation phase, such as the fib model (fib Model-Code, 2010). These models were mostly developed from concretes made with Portland cement and binary binders. As a result, their predictions need some improvements when it comes to the impact of material properties (concretes with high replacements of clinker by MAs) and exposure conditions. It should also be emphasized that most of existing models only deal with the initial phase of corrosion.

The model shown below was developed by A. El Farissi (Farissi, 2020). It uses empirical laws derived from the exploitation of a database of 42 concretes of various mixture proportions with various types of aggregates and MAs as part of a French National project
(PerfDuB), as well as data from the literature, to quantify the phase of corrosion initiation and
propagation(Carcasses et al., 2021).

310 3.1. Initiation period

The modeling procedure is explained in Figure 5. Diffusion is assumed to control the evolution of the carbonation depth (x_c) as a function of time, as done in most analytical carbonation models, such as the fib model (fib model-code 2010). As a result, the carbonation front x_c (mm) is expressed as a function of the square root of time (year^{1/2}) (equation 3):

- 315 $x_c(t) = V_{NAT} \sqrt{t_{eff}}$ (3)
- 316 Where :

$$V_{NAT} = V_{NAT,0} \cdot k_{RH,ini} \tag{4}$$

318 V_{NAT} (*mm. year*^{-1/2}): the natural carbonation rate under actual environmental conditions (T, 319 RH)

320 $V_{NAT,0}$ (*mm. year*^{-1/2}) : the carbonation rate under reference conditions (T=20°C, RH=65%)

321 $k_{RH,ini}$: relative humidity parameter related to the corrosion initiation period

322 t_{eff} (years): the effective carbonation time

323 Each term will be discussed and quantified separately in the following paragraphs.

Carbonation rate is influenced by both material properties and environmental factors. The model accounts for each parameter by decomposing each effect into distinct empirical functions. $V_{NAT,0}$ can be estimated from the results of an accelerated carbonation test because atmospheric carbonation is a long process. The accelerated carbonation test is described in section 2.2.1.a. An empirical relationship between natural carbonation rate under reference conditions $V_{NAT,0}$ (mm.year^{-1/2}) and accelerated carbonation rate V_{ACC} (mm.d^{-1/2}) could be determined from the PerfDuB database (equation 5).

331

$$V_{NAT,0} = 3.03 V_{ACC} \tag{5}$$



333

335

Figure 5: Diagram of the modelling procedure of the initiation period

The influence of ambient relative humidity on the initiation phase is expressed by $k_{RH,ini}$ (unitless). The carbonation rate is primarily controlled by the kinetics of chemical reactions at high RH and by the diffusion of CO₂ at low RH. Carbonation is assumed to be controlled by gas diffusion in the model proposed for carbonation. The effect of low RH cannot be taken into consideration with this model since we assume that the carbonation reaction is immediate. However, an empirical function is used to model the influence of RH over the entire range (0 to 100%) in a phenomenological approach (equation 6):

343
$$k_{RH,ini} = 1.1 \left(1 - \left(\frac{\text{RH} - 50}{50} \right)^2 \right)$$
(6)

344 With RH the ambient relative humidity (%)

It should be noted that this empirical function is maximum at 50% RH, in the literature it has
been shown that the RH leading to maximum carbonation rate can reach 60% (Wierig HJ,
1984). The function can be adapted if specific data on this maximum is available.

 t_{eff} (year), the effective carbonation time: rain-induced wetting/drying cycles have a significant impact on the progress of carbonation front. When the surface of the material is saturated with rainwater, carbonation stops as the gaseous diffusion of CO₂ is not possible anymore. Then a drying phase is required so that the drying front exceeds Xc, allowing CO₂ diffusion and carbonation to proceed (R.F.M. Bakker, 1993). This slows down thecarbonation process.

An effective carbonation time can be calculated based on this observation (equation 7).

$$t_{eff} = t - (t_w + t_d) = (1 - (1 + \beta_w)ToW)t = K_{eff}t$$
(7)

356 With

357
$$K_{eff} = (1 - (1 + \beta_w)ToW)$$
 (8)

358 Where t the overall exposure time, t_w the total wetting time, and t_d the time it takes for the 359 "drying front" to reach the carbonation front.

360 We assume that the relationship between t_d and t_w is linear to simplify this equation. These 361 two times spans are actually tied to the same property: water permeability. t_d could be actually 362 estimated with a drying model, as done in (Thiery et al., 2012) but this requires numerical 363 resolution and the determination of water permeability determination which requires both 364 additional experiments and numerical model (Poyet, 2013). Our objective was to design a relatively simple analytical model with a limited number of input parameters. This 365 366 conservative approach results in the introduction of two parameters: a constant β_w , and the 367 fraction of rainy days per year ToW (Time of Wetness). These recent findings originate from a 368 study conducted by Vu et al. (Huy Vu et al., 2019) on 45 concretes exposed to natural 369 carbonation over 5 years in various countries, whether shielded or not from the rain. β_w was 370 found to be at least 1.5 from these data, and this is the value that was kept.

ToW depends on the exposure class: for classes XC1 to XC3, it is 0; for class XC4, it was set equal to 0.05.

Thus corrosion will be initiated when the carbonation front will reach the reinforcement front and therefore $x_c=c$, c being the concrete cover which is a structural parameter. By inverting equation 4, we obtain:

376
$$t_{ini} = \frac{1}{K_{eff}} \left(\frac{c}{V_{Nat}}\right)^2 \tag{9}$$

377 3.2. Propagation period

The modeling procedure is explained in Figure 6. The electrical resistivity of concrete has a direct impact on the corrosion process because it depicts the current flow between the anodic and cathodic regions. The association between electrical resistivity and corrosion rate has

- 381 been established; for a concrete with a high electrical resistivity, the corrosion current is low,
- and thus corrosion propagation is expected to be slower (Hornbostel et al., 2013).
- 383



Note that the concrete cover c is the same parameter as used in equation 9. In the case of carbonation, we consider uniform corrosion and therefore the ratio c/L is close to 0.

V_{corr} can be calculated as a function of the corrosion current density i_{corr} using equation 12
derived from Faraday's law (valid in the case of uniform corrosion) (François et al., 2018).

401
$$V_{corr} = \frac{\Delta s}{\Delta t} = \frac{M_{Fe}}{\rho s. F. z_a} i_{corr} = 11.61 i_{corr}$$
(12)

402 With V_{corr} (µm/year) the corrosion rate, Δs (m) the loss in diameter, Δt (s) the duration (s), 403 M_{Fe} (56 g/mol) the molar mass of iron, ρs [g/m³] the density of the steel, F the Faraday 404 constant (96500 C), z the number of electrons exchanged at the anode and i_{corr} (µA/cm²) the 405 corrosion current density.

The corrosion current density is determined by an empirical formula obtained from the works
of A. Farissi (Farissi, 2020) based on a bibliographic data analysis (Andrade et al., 1998)
(equation 13).

$$i_{corr} = V_0 \frac{k_T \cdot k_{RH,prop}}{\rho_0} \tag{13}$$

410 - V₀ (= 168.9 μ A.Ωm.cm⁻²) constant which reflects the corrosion potential, obtained from the 411 analysis of literature data

412 - $k_{RH,prop}$ parameter which expresses the influence of RH on the propagation phase.

413 - k_T parameter which accounts for the influence of the temperature on the propagation phase.

414 - ρ_0 [Ω .m] the electrical resistivity of concrete in saturated conditions.

The temperature effect is taken into account using an Arrhenius law (equation 14) as it was done in (Jäggi et al., 2007), where T is the ambient temperature equal to the average annual temperature for a given environment (K), T_0 the reference temperature (293 K) and b is a regression constant equal to 4220 K.

419
$$k_T = e^{-b\left(\frac{1}{T} - \frac{1}{T_0}\right)}$$
(14)

For relative humidity, it is considered that the corrosion process in the case of carbonation has an optimum which corresponds to RH_{crit} for which the corrosion current density is maximum. Given the lack of consensus in the literature on the influence of relative humidity on the corrosion process and after exploitation of a large number of data from the literature 424 (Bouteiller et al., 2012; Stefanoni et al., 2018), the expression of $k_{HR,corr}$ was suggested 425 (equation 15) where

426

$$k_{RH,corr} = \frac{1}{\left(\frac{RH - RH_{crit}}{\alpha}\right)^{\beta} + 1}$$
(15)

427 With:

428 RH: the relative humidity (%)

429 RHcrit: the critical relarive humidity which is considered equal to 95%

430 α and β : regression parameters.

431 Note that RH is the same parameter used to calculate $k_{RH,ini}$ in equation 7. In dry conditions 432 (RH<60%) the corrosion is limited. It was found in (Stefanoni et al., 2018) that for HR=50% 433 the corrosion current is actually reduced by a factor of 200. According to the authors, neither 434 the electrochemistry of the corroding system nor kinetic restrictions resulting from the ohmic 435 resistivity of the pore system nor restricted oxygen availability explain the substantial 436 variation in the corrosion rate when changing RH but rather a surface effect which results 437 from the wetting of the steel surface depending on the relative humidity in the concrete pore 438 system. To take this effect into account, the parameters α and β are defined as follows:

439
$$HR \ge 60\% \quad \alpha = 6, \qquad \beta = 2$$
$$HR < 60\% \quad \alpha = 21, \qquad \beta = 7$$

- 440 **4- Results and discussion**
- 441

4.1. Carbonation and its effects on microstructure

442 The carbonation of concrete is a physico-chemical process in which three mechanisms443 intervene:

- The diffusion of CO₂ inside the concrete, which depends on the transport properties,

- The dissolution of CO₂ and hydration products and their diffusion in the pore solution,

446 - The chemical reaction that produces calcium carbonates.

447 These mechanisms are summarized in the simplified Papadakis model (V. G. Papadakis et al.,

448 1991) that allows, for a case of unidirectional diffusion of CO₂, to describe the progress of the

449 carbonation front (equation 16):

450
$$x_{c} = \sqrt{\frac{2De_{CO_{2}}[CO_{2}]_{0}}{[CaO]_{0}}}\sqrt{t}$$
(16)

451 Where:

- 452 x_c : the carbonation front (mm)
- 453 De_{CO_2} : Effective diffusivity of CO₂ in carbonated concrete (m²/s)
- 454 $[CO_2]_0$: The molar concentration of CO₂ per unit volume of the gas phase (mol/m³)

455 $[CaO]_0$: The total molar concentration of carbonatable CaO (mol/m³)

456 They are concomitant and the carbonation resistance of a material depends on both its 457 physical and chemical properties. In this section the carbonation rate of the studied concretes 458 is analyzed in the light of these properties.

Figure 7 shows the progress of the carbonation front of concretes II, III, C1 and C3 as a function of the square root of time. As a diffusive phenomenon, carbonation can be modeled by Fick's law. Under simplifying assumptions (V. Papadakis et al., 1991), the solution can be expressed in the form of equation 17:

463
$$x_c(t) = V_{ACC}\sqrt{t} \tag{17}$$

464 The curves were approximated by a linear curve. The R^2 of the four regressions were higher 465 than 0.98. The table 6 summarizes the slopes of the curves that represent the accelerated 466 carbonation rate of each concrete.



 Table 6: Accelerated carbonation

 rates of the studied concretes

Concrete	V _{ACC} (mm.t ^{-1/2})	
CEM II	1.67	
CEM III	2.23	
C1	2.70	
C3	2.19	



468 CEM II had the highest clinker content and it exhibited the highest carbonation resistance, C1 469 the lowest, and CEM III and C3 had approximately equal rates. A comparison between CEM 470 III and C1, which have the same clinker content, reveals the negative effect of limestone on 471 the carbonation resistance of the cement. The low carbonation rate observed for CEM II can 472 be ascribed to his high clinker content, which results in higher content of carbonatable 473 material thus higher carbonation resistance. This result is consistent with the findings of 474 (Bolte et al., 2019) for the case of Clinker-Slag-Limestone ternary systems and (Medjigbodo 475 et al., 2018) for Clinker-Metakaolin-Limestone systems.

476 From these data, the carbonation resistance of the studied concretes cannot be simply 477 correlated with cement composition. As previously stated, the resistance to carbonation 478 influences the initiation time of corrosion and, under specific RH conditions, the SL of 479 concrete cover. The influence of microstructural properties and cement composition will be 480 discussed from the experimental results in the following sections. Two microstructural 481 variables may be relevant to investigate in order to understand concretes carbonation results: 482 the chemistry of the microstructure and the PSD, which influences transport properties. We 483 will first attempt to link carbonation resistance to microstructural features, then establish a 484 link between cement composition and the microstructure of cementitious matrix.

485 a- Influence of the chemical parameters

486 CH content before carbonation and after 42 days of carbonation are shown in figure 8. The 487 initial CH content of the various binders varies according to their initial composition; it 488 depends on their clinker content and hydration reactions. After carbonation, the amount of CH 489 consumed varied depending on cement paste initial composition. It was almost entirely 490 consumed for cements with a low clinker content i.e. C1 and CEM III but significant CH 491 content was observed for CEM II after carbonation.

To qualify the hydration products affected by carbonation as well as the carbonation products, XRD analyzes were carried out on C1 cement paste before and after carbonation; the results are shown in figure 9. Before carbonation, significant peaks of ettringite and carboaluminates can be observed. This is due to the presence of calcium carbonates which favors the stabilization of ettringite and hinders AFm formation (Adu-Amankwah et al., 2017). The peak of hemicarboaluminates is preponderant compared to monocarboaluminates. At high carbonate to aluminate ratios, the most stable form of the carboaluminates is

499 monocarboaluminate (Lothenbach, 2010), and this reaction consumes the portlandite and the500 calcite present in the limestone (Antoni et al., 2012).

501 After carbonation, TGA show that the portlandite is partially consumed for all the cement 502 pastes, this observation is validated by XRD analysis on C1 (figure 9 -b). C-S-H being an 503 amorphous phase, its presence is detected by a large bump around $2\theta=30^{\circ}$. This bump 504 flattened after carbonation, which indicates C-S-H carbonation. This reaction results in the 505 formation of vaterite which is detected in carbonated cement paste spectrum (Morandeau et 506 al., 2014). Ettringite was also partially consumed by carbonation. This reaction releases water 507 and leads to the formation of aragonite (Nishikawa et al., 1992). Furthermore, there is a 508 significant reduction in the amplitude of the hemicarboaluminate peak, this may be due either 509 to their carbonation or to their transformation into monocarboaluminates given the formation 510 of calcium carbonates resulting from the carbonation of portlandite and other hydrated phases.

511 Several authors have shown the influence of the initial CH content on the resistance to 512 carbonation (Bucher et al., 2017). CH actually has a buffering effect which allows 513 maintaining a high pH and promotes reinforcements depassivation. Shi et al (Shi et al., 2016) 514 claim that the pH drop after carbonation is not only due to CH carbonation but also to C-S-H 515 carbonation, especially high-Ca C-S-H. Since three studied binders are rich in GGBS, CH is 516 consumed by GGBS hydration to form C-(A)-S-H. The model proposed by Papadakis 517 (equation 16) actually states that the resistance to carbonation reflected by the carbonation 518 front depends on the carbonatable products which include the C-S-H, ettringite, 519 carboaluminates and other hydration products as well as some anhydrous phases (Shi et al., 520 2016). Figure 10 actually shows a inverse relationship (R²=0.97) between the carbonation rate 521 and all the hydrates formed which can be quantified from TGA by BW₄₀₋₅₅₀.



523 Figure 8: Portlandite and bound water (BW_{40-400°C}) content of carbonated and non carbonated 524 cement pastes. NC is for non carbonated and C is for carbonated cement paste





Figure 9: (a) Influence of the carbonation on the microstructure of C1 cement paste (b)
Portlandite peak before and after carbonation. Solid line for non carbonated, and dashed line
for carbonated cement paste. AFm: monosulfoaluminate, CH: portlandite, Mc: monocarbonate,
Hc: Hemicarbonate, Ht: hydrotalcite, CaCO₃ C: calcite, Ar: aragonite, V: vaterite





532 Figure 10: Influence of total bound water on the carbonation rates of studied concretes533

534 b- Influence of the physical parameters

535 The PSD of carbonated and non-carbonated concrete cubes in figure 11 show that before

536 carbonation, the critical pore size decreased when increasing GGBS fraction.



Figure 11: Differential pore size distribution of (a) non carbonated (NC) and (b) carbonated (C)
 concrete cubes

540 The same trend has already been reported in [28]. After carbonation, the peaks are 541 approximately at the same pore size, which is around 80nm except for CEM III which present 542 two peaks, at 6 and 250nm. As shown in figure 8 CEM III cement paste actually had low CH 543 content at later age and given its mineralogical composition, it had lower calcium to silicate 544 (C/S) ratio than CEM I. These conditions allow: 1- C-S-H carbonation which leads to silica 545 gel formation and therefore coarsens the microstructure (Gruyaert et al., 2013), and 2ettringite carbonation which releases a lot of water (Nishikawa et al., 1992). In order to 546 547 understand the effect of the carbonation of hydrates such as CH on the evolution of the pore 548 size, the difference in the threshold radius before and after the carbonation has been plotted as 549 a function of the quantity of carbonated CH expressed as the difference between the CH 550 content before and after carbonation (cf figure 12).



551

552Figure 12: Correlation between the change in threshold pore size before and after carbonation553and the portlandite content consumed by carbonation. rc and rnc represent radii of carbonated554and non carbonated samples respectively.

555

Irrespective of the amount of CH consumed by carbonation, the difference in pore size before and after carbonation is positive. For CEM II, this difference is very small (< 0.05μ m). Furthermore, the higher the increase in the size of the pore radii, the lower the CH consumed by carbonation was, this suggests that it is not the carbonation of CH that is responsible for this increase in pore size, but rather the other hydrates. For the other cements, there was a higher coarsening of the pores, this can be explained by two factors: 1- The carbonation of C-(A)-S-H which produces silica gel and less stable polymorphs of calcium carbonates and 563 ettringite which releases a lot of water, 2- Carbonation shrinkage that occurs at the level of the 564 pores. In fact, the latter results in decalcification and polymerization of C-S-H followed by 565 formation of amorphous silica (Kangni-Foli et al., 2021). For ternary cements for whom little 566 CH is available for carbonation, the PSD is negatively influenced. A similar result was 567 observed in (Shah et al., 2018) for cement pastes made of clinker, metakaolin which has a 568 pozzolanic activity, and limestone. This confirms the observations of Kangni-Foli et al. 569 (Kangni-Foli et al., 2021) who found that carbonation of C-S-H leads to pore size coarsening. 570 It was also found in the same study that the carbonation shrinkage of C-S-H pastes is more 571 pronounced than that of C₃S paste and CH, this may further coarsen even more the 572 microstructure. The authors also concluded that the lower carbonation resistance of some 573 blended cement pastes was due to an increase in CO₂ diffusion coefficient induced by 574 microcracking.

575 Ettringite crystals tend to grow in a direction that is less constrained by solid pores, such as 576 into or around the pores rather than within the solid matrix (directed or non-directed). This 577 crystal development in solid pores can substantially reduce the diameter of micro pores. 578 Furthermore, after carbonation, ettringite is dehydrated and thus its crystals suffer a 579 significant change in a and c lattice parameters, resulting in a decrease in crystal volume 580 (Chen et al., 2019). As a result, the size and volume of pores containing ettringite might be 581 increased.

582 In response to the first question concerning the link between the composition of cement and 583 its resistance to carbonation, a good correlation was found between the rate of accelerated 584 carbonation and the total bound water content of cements (figure 10). Calcium is present in 585 almost all the hydrated phases and it mainly comes from the initial CaO present in the cement 586 and GGBS. In (Shah et al., 2018) the author assumes that only the CaO contained in the 587 clinker is able to bind CO₂. In our study, the active CaO content was calculated as the sum of 588 the CaO contained in the clinker and the GGBS, as the GGBS has latent hydraulic properties 589 which are activated by the hydration of the clinker (Roy and Idorn, 1982). Figure 13 shows a 590 good correlation between the initial content of active CaO and the bound water content of 591 long-term hydrated cement paste, which provides information on the CO₂ binding capacity of 592 binary and ternary cements.



Figure 13: Correlation between total bound water content of mature cement pastes and initial
 reactive CaO content

596

590

600

4.2. Electrical resistivity

601 To standardize the results, the resistivity value retained for each sample corresponds to the 602 slice closest to the center of the cubic sample. The figure 14-a shows the resistivity values 603 plotted as a function of the threshold pore radius. CEM III and C1 had the same clinker 604 content, and their values of electrical resistivity were very close, the difference could not be 605 significant since the error bars overlap. In general, limestone does not have the same 606 refinement effect on the microstructure as GGBS. A high clinker replacement by limestone 607 has been reported to result in increased porosity in (Palm et al., 2016). Moreover, the pore 608 solution composition has also an effect on concrete resistivity. It has been found that the 609 cements containing pouzzolanic MAs are characterized by a lower alkalinity, since the alkali 610 are bound in the C-S-H (Vollpracht et al., 2016). This results in high resistivity values, as 611 observed in Chopperla et al. (Chopperla and Ideker, 2022) for the case of GGBS cement-612 based materials. Since limestone has a long-term diluting effect (Mounanga et al., 2011), its 613 alkalinity-reducing effect may be insignificant.

The plot of electrical resistivity versus the threshold pore entry radius shown in figure 14-a reveals an exponential relationship and figure 14-b shows a strong correlation between threshold pore radius and GGBS content of the cements. This is in accordance with what has

been found in (Medeiros-Junior and Lima, 2016). For a given concrete mixture, GGBS 617 618 content of cement appeared as a good indicator of corrosion propagation time as it gives 619 information about relative variations of electrical resistivity. However, it has been found that 620 the GGBS source may strongly influence the electrical resistivity (van Noort et al., 2016). 621 Otieno et al., (Otieno et al., 2014) have also found that the oxydes composition of slag 622 negatively influences the chloride penetration resistance of concrete since it affects the refinement of concrete microstructure. Thus, since there is a correlation between chloride 623 624 diffusion coefficient and electrical resistivity (Chidiac and Shafikhani, 2020) this confirms the 625 findings of (Van Noort et al., 2016).



Figure 14: Correlation between (a) electrical resistivity and threshold pore radius and (b)
 threshold pore radius and GGBS content of the studied concretes

- 628
- 629

4.3. Service life prediction

630 The service life values given in this section correspond to the sum of initiation and 631 propagation times of carbonation-induced corrosion. The prediction model is used to assess 632 the influence of the main material properties used to characterize each process, respectively 633 accelerated carbonation resistance and resistivity, on the total service life. The environmental 634 conditions correspond to the XC exposure classes. The 4 subclasses XC1-XC4 are defined 635 depending on the specific RH and rain conditions. The effects of temperature and curing 636 conditions are out of the scope of this study. Table 7 describes the input data of RH and ToW 637 (Time of Wetness i.e. the fraction of annual rainy days) for the 4 exposure classes. The cover 638 values taken for each exposure class are those recommended by Eurocode 2 for buildings and 639 SL of 50 years. These values correspond to the minimum cover value (c_{min}) required by this 640 standard, but in reality, an allowance in design for deviation (Δc_{dev}) of 10mm is applied for 641 cast-in-situ concrete, it is mentioned in the reinforcement design to take into account the 642 possible movements of the reinforcements in the formwork at the time of implementation, the 643 sum of the minimum cover value and the allowance in design for deviation is the nominal 644 cover $(c_{nom} = c_{min} + \Delta c_{dev})$. The reinforcements diameter has been set at 20mm, which is a 645 common value in construction projects.

646

647 648

 Table 7: Environmental conditions described by XC exposure class and minimum concrete cover recommended for each class in Eurocode 2

	RH (%)	ToW (-)	Minimum cover c _{min} (mm)
XC1	50	0	15
XC2	90	0	25
XC3	75	0	25
XC4	65	0.05	30

649

650 The isolines of concrete cover SL are shown in figure 15. The duration presented is the sum 651 of the corrosion initiation and propagation times ($t_{SL}=t_{ini}+t_{prop}$). The experimental results were 652 used to predict the SL of the studied concretes for the different exposure classes. CEM III and 653 CEM II are denoted in the graph by "III" and "II" respectively. It is noteworthy that the 654 studied concrete mixtures comply with the requirements of standard EN 206 for an exposure 655 class XC3/XC4 with regard to the minimum cement content and the maximum W/C ratio, and 656 consequently they also comply with XC1 and XC2 classes which are less demanding. In 657 addition, the mixture proportions and constituents of studied concretes were close to the 658 concretes of the database of PerfDuB project concretes, which was used to establish the 659 empirical laws of the model.



Figure 15: Service life duration isolines in years predicted by the model for XC exposure classes

The results of the sensitivity study on the cover value (Figure 16) show that for the most demanding classes, namely XC3 and XC4, taking into account the safety margin clearly improves the service life of the concrete cover and makes it possible to reach the target lifetime for the structural class considered for all the concretes studied.



666Figure 16: Sensitivity study of the concrete cover depth value for 50 years service life: minium667cover c_{min} (solid lines) and nominal cover c_{nom} (dotted lines)

For XC1, the model predicts very long service lives and the iso-SL curves are almost parallel to the abscissa axis. Since the resistivity is much lower, the propagation time is much higher than the initiation time which becomes almost negligible ($t_{SL} \approx t_{prop}$). For all the studied concretes, the model predictions exceed 150 years, which is beyond the target SL for buildings (50 years). This reflects the relatively low corrosion risk in XC1 environments.

For XC2 class, the curves are almost parallel to the y-axis and slightly inclined. Considering the environmental conditions for this class (wet and very rarely dry), the corrosion is enhanced. Therefore, the time of propagation of corrosion is negligible compared to that of initiation ($t_{SL} \sim t_{ini}$).. Hence, the carbonation rate has a key role for this exposure class. In general, all the studied concrete covers have a SL duration of more than 50 years. High RH actually results in low carbonation rate.

For XC3 and XC4, the plots tend to be curved as the SL decreases; for concretes with low carbonation resistance, a high electrical resistivity significantly contributes to improving their SL, as is the case for C1 and CEM III (denoted III on the graph), which have a resistivity of the order of 400 Ohm.m. The curvature of the plots reflects the dominance of one phase over the other. For the domain of ρ and V_{ACC} presented in the graphs, the isolines begin to stabilize from V_{ACC} =1.25 for a SL of 50 years (in XC3), for the XC4 this can be observed for a Vacc < 1 mm.d^{-1/2} for a SL of 100 year life.

From the results above, if the corrosion propagation time is taken into account, concretesmade with ternary cements and relatively low resistance to carbonation can under certain

environmental conditions lead to more durable structures, as is the case for C1 for a XC1,XC3 and XC4 classes.

690

4.4. CO_2 efficiency indicator (CO_2 /Service Life)

691 In order to assess the environmental impact of these new cements, a calculation of CO₂ 692 emissions was carried out. This calculation is based on the emission factors of the various 693 constituents (clinker, GGBS, limestone) collected from LCA analyses and environmental 694 product declaration (EPD)(AFNOR, 2014). The clinker data were provided by French 695 Technical Association of Hydraulic Binders (ATILH) for the year 2017. Emission factors for 696 each component are given in table 8. It is noteworthy to mention that the clinker emission 697 factors are not universal, but rather based on specific production process used in France. This 698 value could vary, for example, if clinker was produced using either fossil fuels or nuclear 699 energy as energy sources.



Table 8: CO₂ emission factors used for the environmental analysis

	Emission factor (l	kg CO ₂ /kg)	Reference
Clinker	0.881		(ATILH, 2017)
GGBS	with allocation ^(*)	0.114	(Chen et al., 2010)
	without allocation	0.085	(Miller, 2018)
Limestone	0.0278		(Proske et al., 2018)
Sand	0.0026		(Bolte et al., 2019)
Gravels	0.0075		(Wang and Lee, 2019)
Superplasticize r	0.767		(Miller, 2018)

701 ^(*) Economic allocation

702 These data were used to calculate the carbon emission of one cubic meter of concrete for each 703 cement studied. This emission was reported to the SL of the concrete cover predicted by the 704 model. This ratio, which is noted CO₂ efficiency indicator (CEI) is a more effective indicator 705 of the environmental impact of these cements since it provides information on the carbon cost 706 of one year of service of the concrete cover, which is proposed as a more representative 707 functional unit for the use of cement. Figure 17 shows the emission factors of the four studied 708 cements as well as their CEI for the composition of the concrete studied for exposure classes 709 XC1-XC4. The values presented are calculated for an average GGBS emission factor. The 710 error bars reflect whether or not the carbon allocation of the GGBS has been taken into





Figure 17: CO₂ emission factor and effective global warming potentiel (CEI) of the cements
 studied for XC1-XC4 exposure classes

715

712

716 A low CEI indicates a lower contribution of concrete production and use to climate change. 717 CEM II, having a relatively high carbon footprint, has a relatively high CEI compared to other 718 cements for almost all exposure classes except XC2 for which the initiation time prevails. 719 CEM III, on the other hand, has a low CEI because there is a good compromise between his 720 CO₂ emission and durability material properties. C1 show low CEI as well, in addition, this 721 has the advantage of containing limestone, which is a natural resource that replace GGBS. 722 GGBS is a more interesting MA since it is reactive in the long term (Giergiczny, 2019). 723 Nevertheless, its carbon allocation is still questioned (Chen et al., 2010). GGBS is an 724 industrial by-product and cannot be considered as waste since its production requires an 725 investment to install granulators in iron manufacturing plants (Scrivener et al., 2018), in 726 addition to the grinding, drying and filtration process necessary to make the product suitable 727 for use in cement. Thus, depending on the carbon allocation of the GGBS, the CEI of these 728 cements will evolve. Moreover, the importance of using GGBS efficiently given its limited 729 availability has been highlighted in the study by Proske et al. (Proske et al., 2018) by 730 introducing a "slag efficiency factor" into their analysis. Moreover, the difference in CEI is 731 not very significant in the case of this study since the difference in the emission factor of the 732 GGBS with and without allowance is not very large (table 8). Note that the allocation

considered is economic; the error bars for GGBS-containing cements could have been larger if another allocation type had been taken into account. Finally, the use of limestone presents an interesting prospect for partially replacing the GGBS in a ternary cement. Its environmental contribution is very low, and the results obtained show that, for a suitable concrete mixture, the material properties are good for an acceptable SL, on the other hand.

738 **5-** Conclusion

739 This paper is focused on the durability performance of concrete made with the ternary 740 cements of the new European standard EN 197-5 relatively to their environmental impact. A 741 new characterization of so-called "low-carbon cements" is proposed based on the CO2 742 emission/service life of the concrete cover under carbonation induced corrosion which takes 743 into account the propagation time as well as the initiation time. An experimental study aimed 744 at determining the durability parameters of several concretes based on binary and ternary 745 cements was carried out. An empirical model that takes into account both the initiation and 746 propagation phases of corrosion process was used to predict the service life of the cover of the 747 concretes studied from material properties. The findings of this study can be summed up as 748 follows:

- 749 1- All the hydration products formed seem to contribute to the carbonation resistance of750 concretes
- 751 2- The initial reactive CaO content of cements, which comes from clinker and slag,
 752 provides information on the amount of water bound in the long term and thus it could
 753 be an indicator of the carbonation resistance for a given concrete mixture depending
 754 on the cement used.
- 755 3- The slag, by its positive influence on the refinement of the porosity, seems to have a
 756 significant effect on the extension of the corrosion propagation time as it contributes
 757 to the improvement of the electrical resistivity
- 4- The model used shows that the propagation duration can predominate over the
 initiation duration, especially under low relative humidity conditions, such as the
 environment described in the XC1 exposure class.
- 5- The new ternary binders seem to have a low CO₂ efficiency indicator (CEI) coefficient
 given their low carbon emission and acceptable service life. The combination of
 clinker, slag and limestone offer new possibilities in reducing the CO2 emissions of
 building materials while meeting the required durability.

Finally, since resistivity depends on the pore size and pore solution, it is interesting to explore the evolution of the resistivity of concrete due to carbonation, as carbonation induces modifications on those properties. This will allow a more precise and realistic prediction given the chronology of the facts: the propagation of corrosion follows its initiation. Further research would be necessary to draw clear conclusions on this issue.

770 CRediT authorship contribution statement

- 771 Imane Elkhaldi: Writing original draft, Investigation, Visualization, Formal analysis
- 772 Emmanuel Roziere: Conceptualization, Methodology, Writing review & editing,
- 773 Supervision
- 774 Philippe Turcry: Conceptualization, Writing review & editing,
- 775 Ahmed Loukili: Conceptualization, Supervision, Funding acquisition, Project administration

776 **Declaration of competing interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personalrelationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

779 Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank EDYCEM company and Ecole Centrale de Nantes for their
financial support and ATILH (Association Technique de l'Industrie des Liants Hydrauliques –

- 782 French Technical Association of the Industry of Hydraulic Binders) for fruitful discussions.
- 783 Geraldine Villain from University Gustave Eiffel is also gratefully acknowledged for her
- support in performing the resistivity tests.

785 **References**

- Aboulayt, A., Jaafri, R., Samouh, H., Cherki El Idrissi, A., Roziere, E., Moussa, R., Loukili,
 A., 2018. Stability of a new geopolymer grout: Rheological and mechanical
 performances of metakaolin-fly ash binary mixtures. Constr. Build. Mater. 181, 420–
 436. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2018.06.025
- Adu-Amankwah, S., 2016. Relationship between Microstructure, Durability and Performance
 of CEM X Composite Cements PhD Thesis. The University of Leeds.
- Adu-Amankwah, S., Zajac, M., Stabler, C., Lothenbach, B., Black, L., 2017. Influence of
 limestone on the hydration of ternary slag cements. Cem. Concr. Res. 100, 96–109.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2017.05.013
- AFNOR, 2014. NF EN 15804+A1, Sustainability of construction works Environmental
 product declarations Core rules for the product category of construction products.

- Alonso, C., Andrade, C., González, J.A., 1988. Relation between resistivity and corrosion rate
 of reinforcements in carbonated mortar made with several cement types. Cem. Concr.
 Res. 18, 687–698. https://doi.org/10.1016/0008-8846(88)90091-9
- Andrade, C., 2010. ELECTRICAL RESISTIVITY AS MICROSTRUCTURAL
 PARAMETER FOR THE MODELLING OF SERVICE LIFE OF REINFORCED
 CONCRETE STRUCTURES. 2nd Int. Symp. Serv. Life Des. Infrastruct. 10.
- Andrade, C., Alonso, C., Sarría, J., 1998. Influencia de la humedad relativa y la temperatura
 en las velocidades de corrosión de estructuras de hormigón. Mater. Constr. 48, 5–17.
 https://doi.org/10.3989/mc.1998.v48.i251.468
- Antoni, M., Rossen, J., Martirena, F., Scrivener, K., 2012. Cement substitution by a
 combination of metakaolin and limestone. Cem. Concr. Res. 42, 1579–1589.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2012.09.006
- Arumugam, C., 2022. Polymer and non-polymer admixtures for concrete roofs: Thermal and
 mechanical properties, energy saving and carbon emission mitigation prospective. J.
 Build. Eng. 16.
- ATILH, 2017. Déclaration Environnementale de Produit in French / Environnemental Product
 B13 Declaration CEM I.
- Berodier, E., Scrivener, K., 2015. Evolution of pore structure in blended systems. Cem.
 Concr. Res. 73, 25–35. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2015.02.025
- Bolte, G., Zajac, M., Skocek, J., Ben Haha, M., 2019. Development of composite cements
 characterized by low environmental footprint. J. Clean. Prod. 226, 503–514.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.050
- Bouteiller, V., Cherrier, J.-F., L'Hostis, V., Rebolledo, N., Andrade, C., Victoire, E.M., 2012.
 Influence of humidity and temperature on the corrosion of reinforced concrete prisms.
 Eur. J. Environ. Civ. Eng. 16, 471. https://doi.org/10.1080/19648189.2012.668004
- Bucher, R., Diederich, P., Escadeillas, G., Cyr, M., 2017. Service life of metakaolin-based
 concrete exposed to carbonation. Cem. Concr. Res. 99, 18–29.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2017.04.013
- 825 Carcasses, M., Cussigh, F., toutlemonde, F., 2021. Definition of performance thresholds
 826 according to exposure classes in french "Définition de seuils de performance en
 827 fonction des classes d'exposition."
- Cardinaud, G., Rozière, E., Martinage, O., Loukili, A., Barnes-Davin, L., Paris, M., Deneele,
 D., 2021. Calcined clay Limestone cements: Hydration processes with high and lowgrade kaolinite clays. Constr. Build. Mater. 277, 122271.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2021.122271
- Chen, B., Kuznik, F., Horgnies, M., Johannes, K., Morin, V., Gengembre, E., 2019.
 Physicochemical properties of ettringite/meta-ettringite for thermal energy storage:
 Review. Sol. Energy Mater. Sol. Cells 193, 320–334.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.solmat.2018.12.013
- Chen, C., Habert, G., Bouzidi, Y., Jullien, A., Ventura, A., 2010. LCA allocation procedure
 used as an incitative method for waste recycling: An application to mineral additions
 in concrete. Resour. Conserv. Recycl. 54, 1231–1240.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2010.04.001
- Chidiac, S.E., Shafikhani, M., 2020. Electrical resistivity model for quantifying concrete
 chloride diffusion coefficient. Cem. Concr. Compos. 113, 103707.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2020.103707
- Chopperla, K.S.T., Ideker, J.H., 2022. Using electrical resistivity to determine the efficiency
 of supplementary cementitious materials to prevent alkali-silica reaction in concrete.
 Cem. Concr. Compos. 125, 104282.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2021.104282

- B47 Di Filippo, J., Karpman, J., DeShazo, J.R., 2019. The impacts of policies to reduce CO2
 B48 emissions within the concrete supply chain. Cem. Concr. Compos. 101, 67–82.
 B49 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2018.08.003
- du Plooy, R., Palma Lopes, S., Villain, G., Dérobert, X., 2013. Development of a multi-ring
 resistivity cell and multi-electrode resistivity probe for investigation of cover concrete
 condition. NDT E Int. 54, 27–36. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ndteint.2012.11.007
- EN 197-5:2021, CEN/TC 51, Cement Part 5: Portland-composite cement CEM II/C-M and
 Composite cement CEM VI, 2021.
- Farissi, A.E., 2020. Prédiction de la durée d'utilisation des ouvrages en béton armé par une
 approche performantielle dans le cas de la corrosion induite par la carbonatation ou
 l'attaque des ions chlorure in French / Prediction of the duration of use of reinforced
 concrete structures by a performance approach in the case of corrosion induced by
 carbonation or attack of chloride ions (phdthesis). Université de La Rochelle.
 https://doi.org/10/document
- François, R., Laurens, S., Deby, F., 2018. Steel Corrosion in Reinforced Concrete, in:
 Corrosion and Its Consequences for Reinforced Concrete Structures. Elsevier, pp. 1–
 41. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-1-78548-234-2.50001-9
- Gartner, E., 2004. Industrially interesting approaches to "low-CO2" cements. Cem. Concr.
 Res. 34, 1489–1498. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2004.01.021
- 866 Giergiczny, Z., 2019. Fly ash and slag. Cem. Concr. Res. 124, 105826.
 867 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2019.105826
- Gruyaert, E., Van den Heede, P., De Belie, N., 2013. Carbonation of slag concrete: Effect of
 the cement replacement level and curing on the carbonation coefficient Effect of
 carbonation on the pore structure. Cem. Concr. Compos. 35, 39–48.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2012.08.024
- Hope BB, Ip AKC, 1987. Corrosion of steel in concrete made with slag cement. ACI Mater J
 525–31.
- Hornbostel, K., Larsen, C.K., Geiker, M.R., 2013. Relationship between concrete resistivity
 and corrosion rate A literature review. Cem. Concr. Compos. 39, 60–72.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2013.03.019
- Huy Vu, Q., Pham, G., Chonier, A., Brouard, E., Rathnarajan, S., Pillai, R., Gettu, R.,
 Santhanam, M., Aguayo, F., Folliard, K.J., Thomas, M.D., Moffat, T., Shi, C., Sarnot,
 A., 2019. Impact of different climates on the resistance of concrete to natural
 carbonation. Constr. Build. Mater. 216, 450–467.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2019.04.263
- IPCC, 2022. Climate Change 2022: Mitigation of Climate Change. Contribution to the IPCC
 Sixth Assessment Report.
- Jäggi, S., Böhni, H., Elsener, B., 2007. Macrocell corrosion of steel in concrete experiments
 and numerical modelling, in: Corrosion of Reinforcement in Concrete. Elsevier, pp.
 75–88. https://doi.org/10.1533/9781845692285.75
- Kangni-Foli, E., Poyet, S., Le Bescop, P., Charpentier, T., Bernachy-Barbé, F., Dauzères, A.,
 L'Hôpital, E., d'Espinose de Lacaillerie, J.-B., 2021. Carbonation of model cement
 pastes: The mineralogical origin of microstructural changes and shrinkage. Cem.
 Concr. Res. 144, 106446. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2021.106446
- Kocaba, V., 2009. Development and evaluation of methods to follow microstructural
 development of cementitious systems including slags PhD Thesis. Ecole
 Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL).
- Lothenbach, B., 2010. Thermodynamic equilibrium calculations in cementitious systems.
 Mater. Struct. 43, 1413–1433. https://doi.org/10.1617/s11527-010-9592-x

- Lübeck, A., Gastaldini, A.L.G., Barin, D.S., Siqueira, H.C., 2012. Compressive strength and
 electrical properties of concrete with white Portland cement and blast-furnace slag.
 Cem. Concr. Compos. 34, 392–399.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2011.11.017
- 900 Markeset, G., Myrdal, R., 2008. Modeling of reinforcement corrosion in concrete State of 901 art (No. 7).
- 902Matschei, T., Lothenbach, B., Glasser, F.P., 2007. The role of calcium carbonate in cement903hydration.Cem.Concr.Res.37,551–558.904https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2006.10.013
- Medeiros-Junior, R.A., Lima, M.G., 2016. Electrical resistivity of unsaturated concrete using
 different types of cement. Constr. Build. Mater. 107, 11–16.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2015.12.168
- Medjigbodo, G., Rozière, E., Charrier, K., Izoret, L., Loukili, A., 2018. Hydration, shrinkage,
 and durability of ternary binders containing Portland cement, limestone filler and
 metakaolin. Constr. Build. Mater. 183, 114–126.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2018.06.138
- Mehdipour, S., Nikbin, Iman.M., Dezhampanah, S., Mohebbi, R., Moghadam, H., Charkhtab,
 S., Moradi, A., 2020. Mechanical properties, durability and environmental evaluation
 of rubberized concrete incorporating steel fiber and metakaolin at elevated
 temperatures. J. Clean. Prod. 254, 120126.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120126
- Miller, S.A., 2018. Supplementary cementitious materials to mitigate greenhouse gas
 emissions from concrete: can there be too much of a good thing? J. Clean. Prod. 178,
 587–598. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.01.008
- Ministry for the ecological and solidary transition, 2020. National low carbon strategy-The
 ecological and inclusive transition towards carbon neutrality 176.
- Morandeau, A., Thiéry, M., Dangla, P., 2014. Investigation of the carbonation mechanism of CH and C-S-H in terms of kinetics, microstructure changes and moisture properties.
 Cem. Concr. Res. 56, 153–170. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2013.11.015
- Mounanga, P., Khokhar, M.I.A., El Hachem, R., Loukili, A., 2011. Improvement of the earlyage reactivity of fly ash and blast furnace slag cementitious systems using limestone
 filler. Mater. Struct. 44, 437–453. https://doi.org/10.1617/s11527-010-9637-1
- Nishikawa, T., Suzuki, K., Ito, S., Sato, K., Takebe, T., 1992. Decomposition of synthesized
 ettringite by carbonation. Cem. Concr. Res. 22, 6–14. https://doi.org/10.1016/00088846(92)90130-N
- Otieno, M., Beushausen, H., Alexander, M., 2014. Effect of chemical composition of slag on
 chloride penetration resistance of concrete. Cem. Concr. Compos. 46, 56–64.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2013.11.003
- 934 Palm, S., Proske, T., Rezvani, M., Hainer, S., Müller, C., Graubner, C.-A., 2016. Cements 935 with a high limestone content - Mechanical properties, durability and ecological 936 characteristics Mater. of the concrete. Constr. Build. 119. 308-318. 937 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2016.05.009
- Papadakis, V., Vayenas, C., Fardis, M., 1991. Physical and Chemical Characteristics
 Affecting the Durability of Concrete. ACI Mater. J. 88, 186–196.
- Papadakis, V.G., Vayenas, C.G., Fardis, M.N., 1991. Fundamental Modeling and
 Experimental Investigation of Concrete Carbonation. Mater. J. 88, 363–373.
 https://doi.org/10.14359/1863
- Poyet, S., 2013. Determination of the intrinsic permeability to water of cementitious
 materials: Influence of the water retention curve. Cem. Concr. Compos. 35, 127–135.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2012.08.023

- Proske, T., Rezvani, M., Palm, S., Müller, C., Graubner, C.-A., 2018. Concretes made of
 efficient multi-composite cements with slag and limestone. Cem. Concr. Compos. 89,
 107–119. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconcomp.2018.02.012
- R.F.M. Bakker, 1993. Model to calculate the rate of carbonation resistance of conrete under
 different climatic conditions,. Rapp CEMIJ Bv Lab Imuiden Holl.
- Roy, D.M., Idorn, G.M., 1982. Hydration, Structure, and Properties of Blast Furnace Slag
 Cements, Mortars, and Concrete. ACI J. Proc. 79. https://doi.org/10.14359/10919
- Rozière, E., Loukili, A., Cussigh, F., 2009. A performance based approach for durability of
 concrete exposed to carbonation. Constr. Build. Mater. 23, 190–199.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2008.01.006
- Scrivener, K.L., John, V.M., Gartner, E.M., 2018. Eco-efficient cements: Potential
 economically viable solutions for a low-CO2 cement-based materials industry. Cem.
 Concr. Res. 114, 2–26. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2018.03.015
- Shah, V., Scrivener, K., Bhattacharjee, B., Bishnoi, S., 2018. Changes in microstructure
 characteristics of cement paste on carbonation. Cem. Concr. Res. 109, 184–197.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2018.04.016
- Shi, Z., Lothenbach, B., Geiker, M.R., Kaufmann, J., Leemann, A., Ferreiro, S., Skibsted, J.,
 2016. Experimental studies and thermodynamic modeling of the carbonation of
 Portland cement, metakaolin and limestone mortars. Cem. Concr. Res. 88, 60–72.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cemconres.2016.06.006
- Stefanoni, M., Angst, U.M., Elsener, B., 2018. Electrochemistry and capillary condensation
 theory reveal the mechanism of corrosion in dense porous media. Sci. Rep. 8, 7407.
 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-25794-x
- Thiery, M., Cremona, C., Baroghel-Bouny, V., 2012. Application of the reliability theory to
 the assessment of carbonation-induced corrosion risk of rebars. Eur. J. Environ. Civ.
 Eng. 16, 273–287. https://doi.org/10.1080/19648189.2012.667987
- 972 Torres-Acosta, A.A., Sagues, A.A., 2004. Concrete Cracking by Localized Steel Corrosion- 973 Geometric Effects. Mater. J. 101, 501–507. https://doi.org/10.14359/13489
- 974 Turcry, P., J. Mai-Nhu, E. Rozière, B. Thauvin, F. Cussigh, 2019. French project "PerfDub"
 975 on performance-based approach: from Round-Robin tests to new test procedures for
 976 durability indicators and accelerated carbonation. Proc. Fib Symp. Concr. Innov.
 977 Mater. Des. Struct. 505–512.
- 978 Tuutti, K., 1982. Corrosion of steel in concrete. Swed. Cem. Concr. Res. Inst. Stockh.
- van Noort, R., Hunger, M., Spiesz, P., 2016. Long-term chloride migration coefficient in slag
 cement-based concrete and resistivity as an alternative test method. Constr. Build.
 Mater. 115, 746–759. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2016.04.054
- Vollpracht, A., Lothenbach, B., Snellings, R., Haufe, J., 2016. The pore solution of blended
 cements: a review. Mater. Struct. 49, 3341–3367. https://doi.org/10.1617/s11527-0150724-1
- Wang, X.-Y., Lee, H.-S., 2019. Effect of global warming on the proportional design of low
 CO2 slag-blended concrete. Constr. Build. Mater. 225, 1140–1151.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2019.07.134
- Wierig HJ, 1984. Longtime studies on the carbonation of concrete under normal outdoor
 exposure. In: Proceedings of the RILEM seminar on the durability of concrete
 structures under normal outdoor exposure 239–49.
- Yang, K.-H., Jung, Y.-B., Cho, M.-S., Tae, S.-H., 2017. Effect of Supplementary Cementitious Materials on Reduction of CO2 Emissions From Concrete, in: Handbook of Low Carbon Concrete. Elsevier, pp. 89–110. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-804524-4.00005-1
- 995